The History of U.S. Politicians, Media, and Public Knowledge: Attitudes and Practices Toward Haitian Migrants and Steps to a More Inclusive Future

Introduction.

Haitian migration to the United States offers a complex view of the intersections of U.S. political dynamics, media representations, and public perceptions. Over the decades, these elements have worked together to shape policies and attitudes often tainted with bias against Haitian and Black immigration. Historical U.S. interventions in Haiti, paired with discriminatory rhetoric from prominent figures like Donald Trump and J.D. Vance, reflect a long-standing prejudice rooted in political and media narratives. Changing this requires evolving legislation, media practices, and public understanding. A more inclusive and empathetic future can be realized through a concerted effort to challenge and reform these systems.

Key Historical Events

Early 19th Century: Haiti's Independence and Economic Isolation

Haiti's 1804 declaration of independence from France was a pivotal moment, as it established the first independent Black-led republic in the Western Hemisphere and the world's first nation to abolish the institution of slavery. (Johnson, 2018). However, the United States and European colonial powers rapidly isolated the newly independent nation of Haiti, both economically and politically. (Pooser, 2012). This intentional marginalization was driven by the fear of a prosperous Black-led republic and its potential ramifications for the institution of slavery within their own domains. As a result, Haiti was cut off from vital trade networks, which had a long-lasting impact on its economic development. Despite being one of the richest places in the world prior to independence—thanks to its profitable coffee and sugar plantations and the enslaved labor that powered them—the newly independent nation struggled under the imposed embargo (Inikori, 2020). These early events not only hindered Haiti's development but also planted the seeds for the racist attitudes and stereotypes that persist in American discourse today. This isolationist response to Haiti's independence echoed in perceptions of Haitian migrants in the following centuries.

Early 20th Century U.S. Intervention in Haiti (1915–1934)

A paternalistic and exploitative dynamic marked the U.S. occupation of Haiti from 1915 to 1934. During this period, the United States implemented policies that perpetuated the stereotype of Haitians as incapable of self-governance, a prejudice deeply rooted in both racial and colonial ideologies. (Brown, 1922). These stereotypes shaped U.S. foreign policy and the domestic media's depiction of Haitians, paving the way for discriminatory immigration policies and public attitudes. The racist ideologies that underpinned the U.S. occupation of Haiti remain deeply rooted in the American perception of Haitian migrants, continuing to influence related policies to this day. (Scuzzarello & Morosanu, 2023).

1980s: The HIV/AIDS Crisis and Media Stereotyping.

During the 1980s, the media unfairly portrayed Haitian migrants as spreaders of HIV/AIDS, fueling both racial prejudice and anti-immigrant sentiment. This depiction led to a widespread belief that Haitian immigrants presented a public health threat (HIV/AIDS: Health and Discrimination, 1999). The content analysis reveals that harmful stereotyping of Haitians was not confined to any single political ideology - both conservative and liberal media outlets disseminated damaging narratives. These media reports reinforced the perception of Haitians as a public health menace, building upon a longstanding tendency to depict Black migrants as disease carriers and disruptive influences. This prejudiced portrayal extended beyond just Haitians, amplifying fears and anxieties surrounding Black immigration more broadly.

1990s: The Haitian Refugee Crisis

The influx of Haitian refugees fleeing political turmoil and economic hardship during the 1990s faced hostility and harsh media portrayals. The Clinton administration detained thousands of these refugees at Guantanamo Bay, often denying them asylum. News outlets reinforced the perception of Haitian migrants as burdens on the U.S. economy, framing them within a broader narrative of crime and violence, a pattern observed in the content analysis of post-earthquake media coverage. This perception aligned with long-standing stereotypes of Black criminality and incapability for self-governance, deeply rooted in the history of slavery and the Haitian Revolution. The depiction of Haitians as "unfit" for integration into (Spencer, 2011) American society profoundly impacted public attitudes and immigration policies.

Post-2010 Earthquake: Media and Stereotype Reinforcement

The devastating 2010 earthquake in Haiti exposed the persistent racial stereotypes entrenched in media coverage. According to a study, over 65% of news stories about the disaster perpetuated stereotype-consistent portrayals of Haitians, often depicting them as impoverished, violent, and chaotic. Conservative media outlets like The Rush Limbaugh Radio Show fueled the narrative that Haitians were reliant on foreign aid, incapable of self-sufficiency, and inherently prone to violence. Even liberal outlets like NPR and The New York Times were not immune to this bias, frequently reinforcing harmful stereotypes through references to Haiti as "one of the poorest countries" and sensationalized depictions of post-earthquake chaos. While some efforts highlighted Haitian resilience, these counter-narratives were often overshadowed by the dominant, stereotype-reinforcing storylines that prevailed(Asante, 2011).

2021: Border Patrol Incidents at the U.S.-Mexico Border.

The disturbing 2021 images of U.S. Border Patrol agents on horseback using whips against Haitian migrants near Del Rio, Texas, provoked global condemnation. This incident powerfully demonstrated how long-standing racial stereotypes and harmful media narratives portraying Black migrants as violent and criminal continue to shape their treatment. The events at the border reinforced a dehumanizing perception rooted in the historical depiction of Black migrants as dangerous and unruly. These biased portrayals, deeply linked to racial stereotypes of Black violence and lawlessness, have an extensive history in U.S. media and policy, as evidenced by the 2010 earthquake coverage analysis.

2022- 2024: Persisting Media and Political Narratives

In the years following 2021, the continuous influx of Haitian migrants at the U.S. border has fueled intense political and media scrutiny. Coverage frequently centers on the perceived "burdens" these migrants are believed to place on U.S. resources and infrastructure, echoing historical narratives that depict Haitians as an economic drain. Conservative commentators have amplified these harmful stereotypes, warning of increased crime and disease, while even some liberal politicians have struggled to counter the dominant negative framing effectively. This demonstrates the deeply entrenched nature of these racial and anti-immigrant biases, which span the political spectrum and maintain a powerful sway over public perceptions and policy decisions.

Recent Rhetoric: Trump and Vance's Anti-Immigrant Discourse

Former President Donald Trump's inflammatory rhetoric, describing Haiti as a "sh*thole country," exemplified the persistence of racially charged depictions of Haitian migrants in contemporary political discourse. Similarly, during his 2022 Ohio Senate campaign, Republican candidate J.D. Vance echoed these sentiments, referencing the "slum countries" from which immigrants come, a clear allusion to Haiti and other nations predominantly populated by people of color. Such statements, amplified by the media, perpetuate the demonization of Haitian migrants, fueling discriminatory policies and public attitudes.

The entangled history of U.S. intervention in Haiti, the media's role in perpetuating harmful stereotypes, and the enduring discriminatory attitudes toward Haitian migrants all compellingly demonstrate the urgent need to adopt a more inclusive and equitable approach to immigration policy and public discourse. To construct a more just future, we must confront the legacy of racial prejudice and colonial exploitation underlying the U.S. government's treatment of Haitian migrants. Only then can we begin to dismantle the structural barriers and biases that have long denied Haitian people their rightful dignity and opportunity. (Celeste, 2013) (Craemer & Martí-nez, 2020)

Part 2: Changing the Narrative: Toward Inclusivity and Harmony Future.

Amplifying Truthful and Nuanced Stories

Transforming public perceptions of Haitian migrants requires amplifying truthful, nuanced narratives. Media organizations wield immense influence in shaping societal understanding of these communities. Responsible, compassionate journalism can dismantle harmful misconceptions, spotlighting the valuable contributions, resilience, and humanity of Haitian migrants. This will foster a more inclusive, positive dialogue around immigration.

A powerful example of reframing narratives is seen in the recent actions of the Florida Immigrant Coalition. By staging protests to highlight the plight of Haitian migrants in Florida, these efforts not only challenge damaging stereotypes but also push local media to facilitate more nuanced discussions. This demonstrates the potential for impactful storytelling to challenge biased perceptions.

Narrative Focus: The Role of Media

Instead of broadly calling for political and legislative reform, we should focus more narrowly on the media's pivotal role in shaping public narratives. Reforming the media is crucial to prevent the amplification of racist and xenophobic discourse. We need more platforms that uplift authentic Haitian voices and robust fact-checking mechanisms to counter disinformation.

One concrete approach is to collaborate with organizations like FactCheck.org, which monitor politicians' statements for inaccuracies. However, amplifying absurd statements can sometimes backfire, giving them more attention than they deserve. A targeted approach is essential, where we carefully decide when to debunk harmful myths and when to avoid fueling their spread. We can also draw on academic theories about media effects, such as the "backfire effect," where too much focus on debunking can inadvertently strengthen misinformation.

Political Accountability

Holding politicians responsible when they use harmful, discriminatory language is crucial to address xenophobia. One effective approach is to amplify the work of independent fact-checking organizations on social media, calling out inaccurate statements made by politicians. Another strategy is to advocate for real consequences, such as public and legal scrutiny, for those who spread misinformation. There are inspiring examples, like in Massachusetts, where the local community in Framingham rallied to support Haitian migrants who had been targeted with inflammatory rhetoric. A Boston Globe story highlighted this community action, providing a model for others to follow. By sharing these uplifting stories, we can encourage more people to hold their leaders accountable for their words.

Ultimately, addressing the long-standing bias against Haitian migrants requires a multifaceted approach that tackles both media narratives and political accountability.

Breaking the Cycle of Discrimination

Haitian migrants frequently confront a vicious cycle of media stereotyping and xenophobic rhetoric, which can escalate into outright discrimination and attacks when they seek social mobility. For example, Haitian workers in jobs shunned by U.S. citizens have faced hostility and prejudice in their workplaces, mirroring the historical pattern of white supremacy targeting those aspiring for advancement.

To disrupt this cycle, we need more than just media reform; we require systemic efforts to cultivate cultural awareness and social inclusion. Initiatives like cultural education programs in schools and workplaces can help shift mindsets and foster greater acceptance of Haitian communities. Likewise, public awareness campaigns organized by immigrant advocacy groups play a vital role in this endeavor.

Public Education and Awareness

Addressing the public's perceptions of Haitian migrants requires a multifaceted approach to education and awareness. Schools and community programs should incorporate more comprehensive curricula on Haiti's rich history and its complex relationship with the U.S. This could foster a deeper understanding of the historical

roots of Haitian migration, effectively dispelling persistent myths and misconceptions. One promising idea is to integrate cultural exchange programs, where Haitian migrants are given platforms to share their personal stories with local communities, particularly in areas where they face the most misunderstanding. Grassroots initiatives like these can create direct connections between migrants and the broader public, breaking down barriers and stereotypes through meaningful, face-to-face interactions.

Support for Migrant Communities

Supporting Haitian and Black migrant communities requires coordinated efforts at both the local and national levels. At the community level, organizations like the Florida Immigrant Coalition have been instrumental in advocating for Haitian migrants and implementing grassroots initiatives to ensure they receive the necessary assistance. These community-driven actions serve as a compelling model that can be replicated in other regions facing analogous challenges.

On a broader scale, nonprofits and advocacy groups must push for more comprehensive policies that expand access to economic opportunities, legal aid, and social services. Mobilizing these collective efforts helps create stronger support networks and counter systemic racism. The focus should encompass both immediate relief measures, such as legal assistance for migrants seeking citizenship, as well as long-term integration strategies, including language training and job placement programs.

References

- Asante, M K. (2011, March 1). Haiti: Three Analytical Narratives of Crisis and Recovery. SAGE Publishing, 42(2), 276-287. https://doi.org/10.1177/0021934710395589
- Brown, P.M. (1922, October 1). American Intervention in Haiti. Cambridge University Press, 16(4), 607-610. https://doi.org/10.2307/2187582
- Celeste, M. (2013, March 1). Framing Haitians and Cubans in The New York Times: Enduring Imprints of Political History., 19(1), 66-94. https://doi.org/10.1353/jhs.2013.0007
- Craemer, T., & Martí-nez, S. (2020, June 2). Anti-Haitian stereotypes in three Dominican daily newspapers: a content analysis. Routledge, 16(1), 85-107. https://doi.org/10.1080/17442222.2020.1773031
- HIV/AIDS: Health and Discrimination. (1999, December 31). https://islandluminous.fiu.edu/part10-slide11.html
- Inikori, J E. (2020, September 25). Atlantic Slavery and the Rise of the Capitalist Global Economy. University of Chicago Press, 61(S22), S159-S171. https://doi.org/10.1086/709818
- Johnson, R A. (2018, February 19). Haiti's connection to early America: Beyond the revolution. Wiley, 16(3). https://doi.org/10.1111/hic3.12442
- Pooser, C. (2012, January 1). Haitian Culture: Largely Untapped Resource for Francophone Studies. American Association of Teachers of French, 85(5), 862-878. https://doi.org/10.1353/tfr.2012.0224
- Scuzzarello, S., & Moroşanu, L. (2023, March 10). Integration and intersectionality: boundaries and belonging "from above" and "from below". Introduction to the special issue. Routledge, 46(14), 2991-3013. https://doi.org/10.1080/01419870.2023.2182649
- Spencer, A. (2011, December 31). A Comparative Analysis of the U.S. Mainstream Press and Black Press Coverage of Jean-Bertrand Aristide from 1991-2011. https://www.hilarispublisher.com/open-access/acomparative-analysis-of-the-us-mainstream-press-and-black-press-coverageof-jean-bertrand-aristide-from-1991-2011-2165-7912.1000136.pdf